

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA  
EASTERN DIVISION

OHIO CASUALTY	)	
INSURANCE COMPANY,	)	
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
v.	)	CIVIL ACTION NO. 3:06CV977-MEF
	)	
MANIFOLD CONSTRUCTION,	)	
LLC, et al.,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	

**REPLY TO  
COUNTERCLAIM**

Comes now the Plaintiff and, in Reply to the Counterclaim of Defendants Manifold Construction, LLC, and Jack Manifold, states as follows:

**FIRST DEFENSE**

1. It admits the allegations contained in paragraphs 1, 2, 3 (but only that the State case was filed in Circuit Court), 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 (but only that the parties engaged in mediation), 11, 12, 13 and 14 of the Counterclaim.
2. It denies the remaining allegations.

**SECOND DEFENSE**

1. It pleads the failure and breach of conditions.

**THIRD DEFENSE**

1. It pleads waiver and estoppel.

**FOURTH DEFENSE**

1. It pleads a material breach.

**FIFTH DEFENSE**

1. It pleads the applicable statutes of limitation.

**SIXTH DEFENSE**

1. It pleads payment.

**SEVENTH DEFENSE**

1. It pleads contributory negligence.

**EIGHTH DEFENSE**

1. It pleads the unconstitutionality of the procedures of awarding punitive damages, and any amounts awarded based on those procedures.

/s/ Christopher Lyle McIlwain, Sr.

Christopher Lyle McIlwain, Sr.

Attorney Code: MCILC 3043

State Code: MCI-002

Attorney for Plaintiff

Ohio Casualty Insurance Company

**OF COUNSEL:**

HUBBARD, SMITH, McILWAIN,  
BRAKEFIELD & BROWDER, P. C.  
808 Lurleen Wallace Blvd., N.  
P. O. Box 2427  
Tuscaloosa, AL 35403  
Telephone: (205) 345-6789

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on August 16, 2007, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to all parties, and I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, there are no non-CM/ECF participants to whom the foregoing is due to be mailed by way of the United States Postal Service.

*s/ Christopher Lyse McIlwain, Sr.*  
Of Counsel